

# VOLUME V

## CONTENTS

Introduction 1

A. Protecting Religion: Some Recollections from Blackstone 1

B. Removal of Protectionist Barriers 5

1. *Burstyn v. Wilson* (1952) 5
2. *Torcaso v. Watkins* (1961) 10
3. The Saga of Ocean Grove 13
  - a. *Percello v. Ocean Grove* (1929) 14
  - b. *Schaad v. Ocean Grove* (1977) 15
  - c. *State v. Celmer* (1979) 20
  - d. Some Reflections on Ocean Grove 23
4. *Larkin v. Grendel's Den* (1982) 25
5. *Thornton v. Caldor* (1986) 29
6. *McDaniel v. Paty* (1978) 30
7. Reflections on “Protections” for Religion 38

C. Appropriate Protections of Free Exercise 41

1. Against Disturbance and Disruption 41
  - a. *ACTION v. Gannon* (1971) 41
  - b. Other Responses to Disruption 47
  - c. A New Federal Statute (1988) 48
2. Other Protections Treated Earlier 49
  - a. No Religious Test 49
  - b. Conscientious Objection to Military Service 49
3. Against Infringement of Autonomy of Religious Bodies 51
  - a. Employment and Labor Relations 52
  - b. The Priest-Penitent Privilege 52
4. Against Impairment of Outreach and Inculcation Activities 52
  - a. Evangelism and Solicitation 53

- b. Health Care and Child Care 53
  - c. Inculcation of Faith 53
- 5. Against Alienation of Children from Their Religious Heritage 54
  - a. Two Contrasting Readings of the Statute 56
  - b. *Wilder v. Sugarman* (1974) 58
  - c. *Wilder v. Bernstein* (1980) 63
  - d. *Wilder v. Bernstein* (1986) 64
  - e. *Wilder v. Bernstein* (1988) 79
- 6. Against Taxation and Examination 84
  - a. Two Rationales of Tax Exemption 84
    - (1) The Tax-Expenditure Rationale 84
    - (2) The Tax-Base Rationale 85
  - b. Exemption from License, Property, Sales and Use Taxes 88
    - (1) *Murdock v. Pennsylvania* (1943) 88
    - (2) *First Unitarian Church v. Los Angeles* (1958) 90
    - (3) *Walz v. Tax Commission* (1970) 92
    - (4) *Texas Monthly v. Bullock* (1989) 102
    - (5) *Jimmy Swaggart Ministries v. California* (1990) 112
  - c. Income Tax Exemption(s) 123
    - (1) *Christian Echoes National Ministry v. U.S.* (1972) 125
    - (2) *Regan v. Taxation With Representation* (1983) 127
    - (3) Blackmun's Concurrence: Hard Money and Soft Money 129
    - (4) *Bob Jones University v. U.S.* (1983) 132
    - (5) The Law of Charities and the Nonprofit Tax Exemption 134
    - (6) *Bob Jones University*: The Majority Opinion 137
    - (7) Justice Rehnquist's Dissent 142
    - (8) Justice Powell's Concurrence 145
    - (9) Some Reflections on Tax Exemption 148
    - (10) Protections for Religion in the Internal Revenue Code 154
    - (11) The "Integrated Auxiliaries" Struggle 155
    - (12) The Problem of Pseudo-Churches 156
      - (a) *Universal Life Church v. U.S.* (1974) 157
      - (b) Mail-Order Ministries 161
      - (c) The "Bubbling Well Church of Universal Love" 162
      - (d) *Basic Bible Church v. Commissioner* (1980) 163
      - (e) *The Ecclesiastical Order of the ISM of AM* 168
      - (f) The Teachings of the Tax Court 171

	(13) <i>Hernandez v. Commissioner</i> (1989)	171
	(14) <i>Davis v. United States</i> (1990)	182
D. Governmental Proprietaries in Religion: Chaplaincies		186
1. The Military Chaplaincy		187
a. <i>Katcoff v. Marsh</i> (1985)		187
b. A Critique of <i>Katcoff</i>		197
c. A Critique of the Military Chaplaincy		201
d. Compulsory Chapel at the Armed Services Academies: <i>Anderson v. Laird</i> (1972)		209
2. Prison, Hospital, Police and Airport Chaplaincies		224
a. <i>Rudd v. Ray</i> (1976)		225
b. <i>Carter v. Broadlawns Medical Center</i> (1987)		232
(1) What a Hospital Chaplain Could Do		235
c. <i>Carter v. Broadlawns Medical Center</i> (1988)		241
d. <i>Baz v. Walters</i> (1986)		246
e. <i>Voswinkel v. Charlotte</i> (1980)		252
f. <i>Brashich v. Port Authority</i> (1979)		258
3. The Legislative Chaplaincy		263
a. <i>Marsh v. Chambers</i> (1983)		263
b. Justice Brennan's Dissent		265
c. Benjamin Franklin's Motion		274
d. Justice Stevens' Dissent		279
E. Government Proprietaries in Religion: Creches and Crosses		280
1. Rites of the Public Cultus		282
2. Governmental Proprietaries in Religion: Creches or Nativity Shrines		285
a. <i>Baer v. Kolmorgen</i> (1958)		286
b. <i>Allen v. Hickel</i> (1970)		288
c. <i>Allen v. Morton</i> (1973)		291
(1) Purpose		292
(2) Primary Effect		295
(3) Excessive Entanglement		299
d. <i>Lynch v. Donnelly</i> (1984)		301
(1) Justice O'Connor's Concurrence		305
(2) Justice Brennan's Dissent		308
(3) Justice Blackmun's Dissent		318

- e. *McCreary v. Stone* (1984) 319
- f. *American Civil Liberties Union v. Birmingham* (1986) 323
- g. *American Jewish Congress v. Chicago* (1987) 330
- h. *ACLU v. Allegheny County* (1988) 338
- i. *Allegheny County v. ACLU* (1989): The Supreme Court Speaks 344
  - (1) The Blackmun Opinion and Holding of the Court 345
  - (2) The Kennedy Opinion 352
  - (3) The Majority's Rebuttal 362
  - (4) Justice O'Connor's Concurrence 369
  - (5) Justice Brennan's Opinion 372
  - (6) Justice Stevens' Opinion 374
  - (7) Musketry in the Margins 375
- 3. Governmental Proprietaries in Religion: Crosses 379
  - a. *Paul v. Dade County* (1967) 380
  - b. *Lowe v. City of Eugene* (1969) 381
    - (1) Act One (February 26, 1969) 382
    - (2) Act Two (October 1, 1969) 384
    - (3) Act Three (December 19, 1969) 384
  - c. *Meyer v. Oklahoma City* (1972) 386
  - d. *Eugene Sand & Gravel v. City of Eugene*, Act Four (1976) 388
  - e. *Fox v. Los Angeles* (1978) 393
    - (1) California Supreme Court Opinion 393
    - (2) Chief Justice Bird's Concurrence 394
    - (3) Justice Richardson's Dissent 396
  - f. *ACLU v. Rabun County Chamber of Commerce* (1983) 399
  - g. *Houston ACLU v. Eckels* (1984) 402
  - h. *Friedman v. Bernalillo County* (1985): Cross on County Seal 406
  - i. *American Civil Liberties Union v. St. Charles* (1986) 409
  - j. *Gonzales v. North Township of Lake County* (1993) 413
  - k. The Supreme Court Approves a Cross: *Capitol Square Review Board v. Pinette* (1995) 415
    - (1) The Court's Opinion 416
    - (2) The Plurality Opinion 417
    - (3) Justice's Thomas' Opinion 419
    - (4) Justice Souter's Opinion 420
    - (5) Justice O'Connor's Opinion 423
    - (6) Justice Stevens' Dissent 427

- (7) Justice Ginsberg's Dissent 431
  - l. Recapitulation of Cases Involving Crosses 432
- 4. Governmental Proprietaries in Religion: Menorahs 433
  - a. *Kaplan v. City of Burlington*, (1989) 434
  - b. *Chabad-Lubavitch of Vermont v. City of Burlington* (1991) 437
  - c. *Chabad-Lubavitch of Georgia v. Miller* (1993) 438
- 5. Good Friday as State Holiday 442
  - a. *Mandel v. Hodges* (1976) 442
  - b. *Griswold Inn v. Connecticut* (1981) 443
  - c. *Cammack v. Waihee* (1991) 445
  - d. *Cammack v. Waihee: Another Dissent* 450
  - e. *Metzl v. Leininger* (1995) 452
  - f. *Metzl v. Leininger: Appellate Decision* (1995) 454
- 6. Other Governmental Uses of Religious Symbols or Practices 457
  - a. *Louisiana ex rel. Singelmann v. Morrison* (1952): Saint's Statue 457
  - b. *Protestants and Other Americans United for Separation of Church and State v. O'Brien* (1967): Christmas Postage Stamp 458
  - c. *Aronow v. United States* (1970): "In God We Trust" 459
  - d. *Anderson v. Salt Lake City* (1973): Ten Commandments 460
  - e. *O'Hair v. Andrus* (1979): The Pope on the Mall 462
  - f. *Gilfillan v. City of Philadelphia* (1980): The Pope on the Fountain 464
  - g. *ben Miriam v. Office of Personnel Management* (1986): "Anno Domini" 470
- F. Boundary Questions: The Riddle of Defining "Religion" and "Church" 472
  - 1. *Malnak v. Yogi* (1979): Judge Adams' Concurring Opinion 476
  - 2. *Africa v. Pennsylvania* (1981) 479
  - 3. *American Guidance Foundation v. U.S.* (1980) 482
  - 4. The IRS 14-Point Description of "Church" 484
  - 5. The Essential Function of Religion 487
  - 6. Why "Establishment" Doesn't Work 489
  - 7. Minimal Dimensions in Space and Time 491