

# VOLUME I

## CONTENTS

Preface i

Introduction: A Brief Biography of the Religion Clauses I - 1

1. The First Century I - 2
2. The Second Century I - 3
3. The Tests of Establishment I - 5
4. Accommodation? I - 6
5. The *Lemon* Test of Establishment I - 7
6. Arguments Over the *Lemon* Test I - 9
7. Church Autonomy I - 11
8. The Free Exercise Clause I - 12
9. The Virtual Demise of the Free Exercise Clause I - 16

Volume I: The Autonomy of Religious Bodies 1

1. Whitefield's Principle 4
2. The Nottingham Purge 5
3. Church Polities 5
4. "Spiritual" v. "Temporal"? 6
5. "Belief" v. "Action" 7
6. Incorporation 8

A. Early Autonomy Decisions 11

1. *Terrett v. Taylor* (1815) 11
2. Attacks on Property Rights of Collectivist Religious Communities 13
  - a. *Waite v. Merrill* (1826) 14
  - b. *Goesele v. Bimeler* (1852) 17
  - c. *Baker v. Nachtrieb* (1856) 20
  - d. *Speidel v. Henrici* (1887) 23
  - e. *Schwartz v. Duss* (1902) 26
  - f. *Iowa v. Amana Society* (1906) 30
  - g. *Order of St. Benedict v. Steinhauser* (1914) 35

- B. Church Property 39
1. *Watson v. Jones* (1872) 39
  2. *Gonzalez v. Archbishop* (1929) 41
  3. *Kedroff v. St. Nicholas Cathedral* (1952) 41
  4. *Kreshik v. St. Nicholas Cathedral* (1960) 42
  5. *Presbyterian Church v. Hull Church* (1969) 43
  6. *Eldership v. Sharpsburg Church* (1970) 44
  7. *Serbian Eastern Orthodox Diocese v. Milivojevich* (1976) 45
  8. *Jones v. Wolf* (1979) 50
  9. Commentary on the Decisions 57
    - a. Zollman's *American Church Law* (1917) 57
    - b. Adams and Hanlon, "*Jones v. Wolf*" 57
    - c. Tribe, *American Constitutional Law* 61
  10. A Critique of The Critics 62
    - a. Which "Neutral Principles"? Trust, Contract or Some Other? 62
    - b. How Connectional Churches Really Start 63
    - c. The *Krauczunas* Litigation Over Lay Trusteeship 68
  11. Further Developments 71
    - a. *Russian Orthodox Church Outside Russia v. Church of the Holy Resurrection* (1995) 74
    - b. *Russian Orthodox Church Outside Russia*: Petition to the Supreme Court 77
  12. Landmarking of Church Buildings 81
    - a. *Lutheran Church v. New York City* (1974) 81
    - b. *Penn Central v. New York City* (1978) 83
    - c. *Ethical Culture Society v. Spatt* (1980) 84
    - d. *Church of St. Paul and St. Andrew* (1986) 84
    - e. *St. Bartholomew's Episcopal Church* (1990) 89
    - f. Trying to Change the Law 93
    - g. *Society of Jesus v. Boston Landmarks Commission* (1989) 94
    - h. *First Covenant Church v. City of Seattle* (1992) 97
    - i. *First United Methodist Church v. City of Seattle* (1996) 106
    - j. *Condemnation: Pillar of Fire v. City of Denver* (1973) 107
    - k. *Flores v. City of Boerne* (1996) 110
  13. Rights of Ownership: *Struempf v. McAuliff* (1983) 116
  14. Zoning of Church Property 119
    - a. *Lakewood Jehovah's Witnesses v. City of Lakewood* (1983) 122
    - b. *Grosz v. City of Miami Beach* (1983) 126

- c. *Islamic Center v. City of Starkville* (1988) 130
- d. *Messiah Baptist Church v. County of Jefferson, Colorado* (1988) 134
- e. *Christian Gospel Church v. San Francisco* (1990) 139
- f. *Lucas Valley Homeowners v. Marin County* (1991) 146
- g. *Western Presbyterian Church v. Bd. of Zoning Adjustment* (1994) 149

#### C. Church Membership 153

- 1. The “Power of the Gate” 153
- 2. Some Commentators 156
- 3. *Bouldin v. Alexander* (1872) 157
- 4. Should Courts Correct Abuses Within Churches? 159
- 5. Litigation Over Church Discipline 162
  - a. Shunning 163
    - (1) *Bear v. Mennonite Church* (1975) 163
    - (2) *Paul v. Watchtower Bible & Tract Society* (1987) 166
  - b. “Squire” v. Elders 168
  - c. *Guinn v. Church of Christ* (1984) 170
- 6. Can Churches Discriminate? 173

#### D. Church Employees 175

- 1. Some Early Cases 177
  - a. *Permoli v. New Orleans* (1845) 177
  - b. *Cummings v. Missouri* (1866) 182
  - c. *Church of the Holy Trinity* (1892) 190
  - d. *Gonzalez v. Archbishop* (1929) 191
  - e. *Serbian Eastern Orthodox Diocese* (1975) 191
- 2. The Clergy-Laity Distinction 192
  - a. The Civil Rights Act of 1964, Amended in 1972; Title VII 192
  - b. *McClure v. Salvation Army* (1972) 193
  - c. *Equal Employment Opportunity Commission v. Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary* (1981) 193
- 3. Church Autonomy and Labor Law 194
  - a. *NLRB v. Catholic Bishop of Chicago* (1979) 195
  - b. *Catholic High School Association v. Culvert* (1985) 198
  - c. *St. Martin's Evangelical Lutheran Church v. South Dakota* (1981) 205
  - d. *California v. Grace Brethren Church* (1982) 205
  - e. *Tony and Susan Alamo Foundation v. Secretary of Labor* (1985) 206
- 4. Recognition of Autonomy in Church Employment 209

- a. *Rayburn v. Seventh-day Adventists* (1985) 209
- b. *Corporation of the Presiding Bishop v. Amos* (1987) 214

#### E. Church Resources 224

- 1. The State Takes Over a Church 225
  - a. The Worldwide Church of God 229
  - b. The State's "Public Trust" Theory 231
  - c. Some Commentators 233
    - (1) Dallin H. Oaks 233
    - (2) Charles M. Whelan, S.J. 234
    - (3) Morton Jackson 235
  - d. A Court Speaks—Belatedly 236
- 2. The State Voids an Ecclesiastical Trust 237

#### F. Church Structures 240

- 1. *Smith v. Swarmstedt* (1853) 240
- 2. *Serbian Eastern Orthodox Diocese* (1976) and *St. Martin's Church v. South Dakota* (1981) 245
- 3. *Barr v. United Methodist Church* (1979) 246
- 4. "Ascending Liability" 251
- 5. "Integrated Auxiliaries" 256
  - a. The Struggle Against the Regulation 258
  - b. *Lutheran Social Service of Minnesota v. U.S.* (1985) 260
  - c. *Tennessee Baptist Children's Homes v. U.S.* (1986) 262
- 6. *Moon v. U.S.* 265

#### G. Church Records and Internal Communications 267

- 1. The Priest-Penitent Privilege 268
- 2. Beyond the Priest-Penitent Privilege 273
- 3. *State v. Szemple* (1994) 277
- 4. *Surinach v. Pesquera de Busquets* (1979) 283
- 5. Government Infiltration of Churches 287
- 6. Church Records Can Be Sensitive 292
  - a. Counseling Files 292
  - b. Lists of Church Members and Contributors 292
  - c. Lists of Contributors with Amounts Contributed 293
  - d. Minutes of Church Board and Committee Meetings 293
  - e. "Nothing to Hide"? 294
  - f. Limited Disclosure? 295

- 7. The Great Church Raid of 1977 296
- 8. *Alberts v. Devine, Carroll and Barclay* (1985) 299
  
- H. Freedom of the Pulpit 307
  - 1. *Delk v. Kentucky* (1915) 307
  - 2. *Guinn v. Church of Christ* (1984) 309
  
- I. The Tragedy at Waco: An Annihilation of Autonomy 311
  - 1. "Report of the Treasury Department..." 312
    - a. The Investigation 312
    - b. The Tactical Decision: Plans and Preparations 313
    - c. The Raid 313
    - d. The Report's Conclusions 315
    - e. Evaluation of the Decision to Raid the Compound 317
  - 2. "Report to the Deputy Attorney General..." 320
    - a. Conclusion of the Chronology of the Siege 320
    - b. Some Elements of Evaluation by Justice Department Staff Team 322
    - c. The Davidians' Outlook 323
    - d. Reasons for the Tear-gas Action 324
  - 3. Summary of Evaluations by Social Science Experts 325
    - a. Nancy T. Ammerman 325
    - b. Robert Cancro, M.D. 329
    - c. Lawrence E. Sullivan 331
    - d. Alan A. Stone, M.D. 333
  - 4. The Criminal Trial 337
    - a. Charges and Countercharges About the Raid 338
    - b. Testimony of Kathryn Schroeder 341
    - c. Testimony About the Final Act 344
  - 5. The Verdict and Sentences 347
  - 6. The Fifth Circuit's Decision on Appeal 351
  - 7. A Congressional Investigation and Report 358
  - 8. Some Reflections on the Waco Tragedy 370
    - a. Was There "Probable Cause" for the Warrants? 371
    - b. The Charges of Child Abuse 372
    - c. Responsibility for Tragedy 373
    - d. Was Religious Liberty Violated at Waco? 375
    - e. Are Religious Groups "Above the Law"? 377
    - f. Why Religious Groups Should be Let Alone 378